

Illegal Wildlife Trade: Half Year Report

(due 31st October 2015)

Project Ref No	IWT016
Project Title	Strengthening institutional frameworks to combat wildlife trafficking in Indonesia
Country(ies)	Indonesia
Lead Organisation	WCS
Collaborator(s)	Directorate General of Natural Resources and Ecosystem Conservation (KSDAE, the CITES Management Authority) of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (MoEF), Government of Indonesia; Indonesian Institute of Science (LIPI, the CITES Scientific Authority); Indonesian National Police; Eijkman Institute for Molecular Biology; TRACE Wildlife Forensics Network; UNDP.
Project Leader	Dr Tom Clements
Report date and number (eg HYR1)	30 th September 2015, (HYR1)
Project website	programs.wcs.org/Indonesia

1. Outline progress over the last 6 months (April – Sept) against the agreed baseline timetable for the project (if your project has started less than 6 months ago, please report on the period since start up to end September).

The Project. In this project, WCS is scaling-up lessons learned from 10 years of operating the Wildlife Crimes Unit (WCU) to address the systemic institutional and capacity barriers that limit effective national-level action on illegal wildlife trade in Indonesia and the region. WCS will work with partners (Eijkman Institute, TRACE Wildlife Forensics Network and UNDP) to support the Indonesian government agencies (especially Police, LIPI and MoEF) to:

- I. Strengthen the legal framework regarding wildlife crime and illegal wildlife trade, including CITES implementation, by removing loopholes and inconsistencies in the current regulations (particularly for African elephants and other non-native species).
- II. Strengthen the capacity of Indonesian law enforcement agencies to apprehend and prosecute wildlife traffickers.
- III. Undertake at least 20 high-profile cases against prominent wildlife trafficking networks focused on tigers, rhinos, elephants and pangolins.
- IV. Around critical tiger conservation landscapes in Indonesia, support local communities to mitigate tiger conflict, reducing damages to humans and their property as well as reducing tiger mortalities which then enter the trade.
- V. Enhance national and regional collaborations both between Government of Indonesia law enforcement agencies and with other Southeast Asian nations (especially Vietnam), serving as a model for inter-agency and south-south collaboration to combat illegal wildlife trade.

In parallel, under Darwin Project 22-008, WCS is supporting the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries (MMAF) with efforts to reform the legal and policy framework for marine species and to combat illegal trade for marine species. Achievements for terrestrial species (under MoEF) are reported in this report, and achievements for marine species (under MMAF) are reported in the Darwin half-year report.

Project updates (end of September 2015). The project started in February 2015, and has been under implementation for 8 months. Major achievements during this period have included:

Legal and regulatory reform:

Wildlife protection legislation and regulation of wildlife trade in Indonesia (including CITES) is based upon Conservation Law No.5/1990 and its subsidiary regulations, especially Government Regulation GR No.7/1999 and GR No.8/1999. These are very out of date and contain significant loopholes. WCS achievements during the reporting period include:

- With co-finance support from USAID, two reports were produced analysing illegal wildlife trade in Indonesia. These addressed the legal and policy context (Activity 1.1; *Wildlife Trade, Wildlife Crime and Species Protection in Indonesia: Policy and Legal Context*¹) and an overview of knowledge about wildlife trade in Indonesia (Activity 1.2; *Wildlife Crime in Indonesia: a rapid overview of the current knowledge, trends and priority actions*²).
- Following publication of these reports, support has been provided to the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (MoEF), to implement the report recommendations to revise the legal framework for species protection.

Reform of Law No.5/1990

- On 25 May 2015, an agreement was reached between the Indonesian Parliament (DPR) Commission 4 and the Minister of Environment and Forestry, under which Law No.5/1990 will be forwarded to the DPR for revision in the legislative program for 2016 (the prolegnas). This is a huge achievement, because it means the law will now be revised. Each commission can only propose two laws for revision each year. The case was helped by a story about cockatoos being smuggled in bottles, which led to a change.org petition WCS assisted with which received over 162,000 signatories (<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/man-arrested-in-indonesia-over-alleged-smuggling-of-endangered-cockatoos-10228084.html>)
- Support and technical resources for the CSO coalition POJKA Kebijakan (the Conservation Policy Working Group) to lead technical discussions on the review of Law No. 5/1990, as well as directly facilitating discussions with MoEF. During March – September 2015, in collaboration with POKJA, WCS supported and participated in a series of 10 meetings (held in Jakarta, Sumatra, Sulawesi, and Kalimantan) focusing on the revision of Law No. 5/1990 (10-15 participants in each meeting).
- Organizing a high-level focus group discussion (September 2015), focusing on the issue of improving species protection under Law No. 5/1990. MoEF agreed that the revised Law should always reflect the current and existing CITES list – a landmark step towards improved legal protection. The discussion was attended by 10 senior participants from LIPI, MoEF, and a number of other NGOs.

Updating the existing Protected Species List

- Progress on rapidly updating the existing protected species list (GR No.7/1999) to include additional species, for example manta rays and African elephants (Activity 1.3). This is also a critical process, as the final revision of Law No.5/1990 is not expected until late 2016, and this will close remaining loopholes in the interim period. WCS conducted four internal meetings with the MoEF Directorate of Biodiversity Conservation (KKH)'s CITES focal point in April, May, June, and July (Activity 1.4) and three meetings with LIPI, the CITES scientific authority, in May, June, and August. In

¹ Available from USAID at:

<https://dec.usaid.gov/dec/content/Detail.aspx?q=KERvY3VtZW50cy5Eb2N1bWVudF9UaXRzZTood2lsZGxpZmUpKSBBTkQgKERvY3VtZW50cy5EZXNjcmlwdG9yc19HZW9ncmFwaGljOigiSW5kb25lc2lhlkpk&ctID=ODVhZjk4NWQtM2YyMi00YjRmLTkxNjktZTcxMjM2NDBmY2Uy&rID=MzYyMzE5&qcf=ODVhZjk4NWQtM2YyMi00YjRmLTkxNjktZTcxMjM2NDBmY2Uy&ph=VHJ1ZQ==&bckToL=VHJ1ZQ==&>

² Available from USAID at:

<https://dec.usaid.gov/dec/content/Detail.aspx?q=KERvY3VtZW50cy5Eb2N1bWVudF9UaXRzZTood2lsZGxpZmUpKSBBTkQgKERvY3VtZW50cy5EZXNjcmlwdG9yc19HZW9ncmFwaGljOigiSW5kb25lc2lhlkpk&ctID=ODVhZjk4NWQtM2YyMi00YjRmLTkxNjktZTcxMjM2NDBmY2Uy&rID=MzYyMzE5&qcf=ODVhZjk4NWQtM2YyMi00YjRmLTkxNjktZTcxMjM2NDBmY2Uy&ph=VHJ1ZQ==&bckToL=VHJ1ZQ==&>

part due to WCS pressure and the key coordination role WCS has played between among these agencies during the reporting period, LIPI and MoEF are now planning to issue the updated list before by January 2016, after a public consultation meeting which will be held either in November 2015.

Capacity building on wildlife crime, and targeted government engagement

In the reporting period WCS organized trainings for Indonesian management and law enforcement agencies (i.e., MoEF, Indonesian National Police, Customs) and the Financial Transactions Analysis and Reporting Center (Pusat Pelaporan dan Analisis Transaksi Keuangan – PPATK; Indonesia’s anti-money laundering agency) to build their knowledge and capacity regarding wildlife crime, the laws and regulations that can be used effectively for prosecution of selling or trafficking of endangered species, and the identification of species and their parts. Key achievements included:

- In collaboration with the Criminal Investigation Division (CID) of the Indonesian National Police (INP), on August 6, 2015, WCS’s Wildlife Crimes Unit (WCU) trained 35 police officials from 35 provincial police offices in Indonesia (Activity 2.1 and 2.2) The aim of the training was to improve the skills of provincial police officials to detect illegal wildlife trafficking in their regions. WCU provided updates on protected wildlife trade ‘hotspots’ for wildlife smuggling (exit points, transit points, and entry points) in Sumatra, Java, and the Wallacea Biodiversity Hotspot “region.” WCU staff also shared recent modus operandi on wildlife trafficking, including online trade, transactions, and shipping.
- WCS also finalised an MOU with the TRACE Wildlife Forensics Network, and the Eijkman Institute (the Indonesian research institute for molecular biology) to begin the process of building increased capacity for forensic testing of species identified in the illegal trade to support the increased use of wildlife forensics data in prosecutions. Senior female Indonesian scientists are leading the implementation of this Activity (Activity 2.4) within Eijkman and TRACE.
- As a result of this partnership in April 2015, WCS supported a training program held by the Eijkman Institute for Molecular Biology, in collaboration with The Society of Indonesian Science Journalists (SISJ) in Jakarta. The training’s objective was to provide updates on forensic technologies techniques for species identification conducted by the Eijkman Institute, in order to support the work of police and civil investigators. The training was attended by 50 staff representing law enforcement agencies, including police investigators from the Indonesian National Police, civil investigators from MoEF, and journalists from various national media. WCS’s WCU shared updates on the current modus operandi in wildlife trafficking and help to create an effective communication platform for ongoing collaboration among police/civil investigators, the WCU, and the Eijkman Institute, to assist in streamlining forensic examinations for judicial processes, including DNA tests to identify animal parts confiscated during arrests.
- On February 15, 2015, PPATK and WCU organized an in-house training program to increase the capacity of 15 PPATK officials (Activity 2.3). WCU’s demonstrated the various modus operandi carried out by organized criminal groups to trade and smuggle wildlife, and shared intelligence information related to middlemen involved in money laundering. There are strong indications gathered from manta ray and shark cases for example that the profits from the illegal trade and smuggling of manta plates and shark fins were laundered to operate some legal businesses. The bank accounts of five middlemen were analyzed by PPATK, and the result of this analysis was disseminated to police investigators.

Progress against Activity 2.5 (centralised wildlife crime database) has been made in the first reporting period, but concrete outcomes are not expected until mid-2016.

Wildlife Crimes Unit facilitated arrests and prosecutions:

Since February, WCS’s Wildlife Crimes Unit (WCU) has supported Indonesian law enforcement agencies to carry out 26 arrests involving 37 perpetrators, and has provided follow-up legal support to subsequent prosecutions (Activity 3.1, 3.2, 3.3). Details of some of the cases are in

the attached compilation of press releases, which have generated significant media interest (Activity 3.4). Key achievements include:

- Arrests and huge hauls of Critically Endangered pangolins from Medan (5 tons); manta ray bone and gill plates (over 1 ton); 6 separate tiger cases; 2 elephant ivory cases, and the seizure of over 500kg of endangered oceanic whitetip shark fins.
- The majority of these cases remain in process, however initial prosecution successes include the arrest and imprisonment for two years of an Orangutan trader. It is anticipated that eventual prosecution rates will be high (over 80%) due to the support of the WCU dedicated legal team, and the increased use of forensic evidence in the support of prosecutions (Activity 3.2). This will be confirmed in the following report period.
- Separately, the WCU assisted the Metropolitan Police Wildlife Crime Unit with a case involving a primate trader from the UK, who was working with a trader in Indonesia. The Indonesian trader was sentenced to 10 months in prison, while the UK court case is expected later in 2015.
(see <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/02/01/endangered-deaths.html>)
- Through collaborations with Indonesian journalists (the Alliance of Independent Journalists Aliansi Jurnalis Independen and the Indonesian Journalists Association Persatuan Wartawan Indonesia), over 150 articles have appeared in the media, with the majority in Bahasa Indonesian. This helps to promote action on illegal wildlife trade and ensure transparent, fair application of the law in wildlife crime cases. For example, when a legal case is handled well it is important that all of the key government officials are publicly praised. This helps to keep proceedings fair, transparent and uncorrupted and ensures that government officials receive recognition and promotion within their own government system. An example link to media coverage related to orang-utan cases in this reporting period is below:
http://dotearth.blogs.nytimes.com/2015/04/20/sumatran-authorities-arrest-wildlife-dealer-caught-with-young-orangutan/?_r=0

Human-wildlife conflict mitigation

Since February, WCS has supported Wildlife Response Units (WRUs) in two critical tiger landscapes – the Leuser Ecosystem and Bukit Barisan Selatan landscape, two of the priority tiger, Asian Elephant and Sumatran Rhinoceros landscapes in Indonesia (all three species are Critically Endangered). Leuser also contains >75% of the world's Sumatran Orang-utan population (also Critically Endangered). The WRUs are human-wildlife conflict mitigation response teams, which work with local communities to reduce conflicts with tigers, elephants and orang-utans and thereby prevent loss of livestock, crop damages, human mortalities, and revenge killing of those species. If unchecked, such conflict can have significant impacts on human livelihoods. In addition, tigers, Orang-utans and Asian elephants frequently initially enter illegal wildlife trade networks through becoming embroiled in conflict. Key achievements included:

- Since February 2015, the WRUs have responded to 44 human-wildlife conflict cases across the two landscapes, of which 17 involved human-tiger conflict and two human-orang-utan conflict. These two orang-utans were relocated to safe forest areas (Figure 3) as the conflicts occurred as the result of orang-utans consuming local crops (banana, palm oil, sago palm).
- Of the 17 human-tiger conflict cases, seven involved incidences where tigers had killed cattle in communities (four cows and five buffaloes). On February 16, 2015, a WRU team received information of one tiger that was accidentally captured in a pig snare in Siantar Sigordang village (North Sumatra Province) and was killed by a perpetrator. The team, along with North Sumatra Nature Conservation Agency (BBKSDA Sumatera Utara), was deployed to verify this information. The community was reluctant to hand over the dead tiger, and it became clear that the tiger had been skinned and separated into pieces to be sold. The WCU is now handling this case.
- In collaboration with communities, WCS also built 10 additional Tiger Proof Enclosures

in conflict areas to further support a reduction of future tiger conflicts.	
Activities under Output 5 (key international strategic partnerships, transnational wildlife crime supply chain network research) are making progress but more concrete outcomes are expected during the second reporting period.	
2a. Give details of any notable problems or unexpected developments that the project has encountered over the last 6 months. Explain what impact these could have on the project and whether the changes will affect the budget and timetable of project activities.	
None.	
2b. Have any of these issues been discussed with LTS International and if so, have changes been made to the original agreement?	
Discussed with LTS:	Yes/No
Formal change request submitted:	Yes/No
Received confirmation of change acceptance	Yes/No

3a. Do you currently expect to have any significant (eg more than £5,000) underspend in your budget for this year?	
Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Estimated underspend: £
3b. If yes, then you need to consider your project budget needs carefully as it is unlikely that any requests to carry forward funds will be approved this year. Please remember that any funds agreed for this financial year are only available to the project in this financial year.	
If you anticipate a significant underspend because of justifiable changes within the project and would like to talk to someone about the options available this year, please indicate below when you think you might be in a position to do this and what the reasons might be:	

4. Are there any other issues you wish to raise relating to the project or to IWT challenge Fund management, monitoring, or financial procedures?
None

Please note: Any planned modifications to your project schedule/workplan can be discussed in this report but **should also be raised with LTS International through a Change Request.**

Please send your **completed report by email** to Joanne Gordon at IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk. The report should be between 2-3 pages maximum. **Please state your project reference number in the header of your email message eg Subject: 001 IWT Half Year Report**